The Meeting of the Board of Education was held at the Blake Building, 25 Ogden Street, West Haven. The meeting was called to order by Chairman John Carrano at 7:00 p.m. The meeting opened with a pledge to the flag.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:  Anne Heffernan 7:05 arrived
                    Krista Pickering
                    Howard Horvath
                    Raymond Collins
                    Paul Messina
                    John M. Carrano
                    Toni Paine
                    George Monahan
                    Robert Guthrie

ADMINISTRATORS PRESENT:  Superintendent Paul Tortora
                    Assistant Superintendent Neil Cavallaro

George Monahan, asked for a moment of silence for a West Haven who was killed in Iraq

B.  Public Portion of Meeting.

Chairman Carrano asked if anyone wished to address the Board.
Nancy Rossi, 12 Robin Road, West Haven, CT 06516
Two things, I would l9ike to address, the decision of the impartial hearing officers. I am going to a hearing this time. I am interested in how since if you look at the timing, since the ad-hoc committee was appointed now the decisions have become education records, if they were education records to begin with. I should not have the 50 I have sitting in my house. Also as far as the privacy act. I have been in contact with a gentleman in Washington that heads up that department. The only thing that you are responsible for is to make sure that the personally identifying information mentioned. So I would like to get a ruling on this, so we can move forward. The hearing will probably be in three to four months. I will keep you informed. I only cc the letter to John Carrano and sent to Paul Tortora. Second, we all know that John Carrano is Leaving tonight and he will be missed. I think he did a great job for the Board of Education for the children. I hate to see him go, even though he will still be sitting on the board just not as Chairman. I sincerely hope what ever decision as to sits in that chair that they follow through on all the things that have been started. The disciplinary procedure is very important and need to be looked at so that everyone is treated fairly. The community service issue noncompliance and what small percentage there is, back when it was passed I was totally against it. I felt that these children are already burdened with jobs and other things and that they may not be able to comply.
3rd, I would like to see the law firm go out to bid. The law firm makes a decent chunk of money.  If it is still awarded to the same law firm, so be it but it should go out to bid. Also I have talked about this that they should be held to a more itemized billing from our law firm. Instead of having a generalization. For instance the attorney is at the Board meeting, it should have the date, attendance at Board meeting and how long he was here, was the attorney here an hour or 2 hours. The way it reads now is it gives a total so many pages after a generalization. Again I would like to wish John Carrano good luck and he should now have a lot more time with his family. Thank you

Chairman Carrano asked if anyone else wished to address the Board
For a second time, would anyone else like to address the Board?
Chairman Carrano for a third and final time, does anyone wish to address the Board.
Public session closed at 7:05
WEST HAVEN BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES
January 19, 2005

C. Reports:


Superintendent Tortora, I just want to remind the Board we have three budget meetings January 25, January 31 and February 2 if needed. We have our work cut out for us. We appreciate your attendance. I would just like to update the Board we had three or four schools due to the extreme weather conditions had trouble with the heat in some of the classrooms. We had a few situations with the new areas at Mackrille. Haley, Pagels also had a few issues. All of that seems to be under control. Although, I would not consider it perfect yet. Then we had Forest, which was the most problematic. We meet with Elias, Superior and the mechanical engineer who designed the system. So it has been a little problematic over there. We had about a third of the building reach temperatures of 60 on down to the 50’s. 65 is the magic number when considering moving the children or canceling school. We were able to move classrooms out of the most problematic areas. Tomorrow we will be working on that. It is the old part of the building, just so you know. So just to keep you informed of a couple of problems. Also John I am truly sorry to have you step down at Chairman, you have done an outstanding job and have always tried to be sensitive to labor and community, and always the children first. I just want to compliment you and express my gratitude.

John Carrano, Mr. Tortora informally you asked me about Executive Session. Mr. Tortora, yes I did ask that when we reach the termination section on here that we move into Executive Session.

John Carrano, can I have a motion to move Executive Session from G to right before D.4
MOTION made by Robert Guthrie and SECONDED by M. Toni Paine. Discussion:
Motion passed unanimously

Executive Session has been moved to before D.4

C.1.a. Administration.

Neil Cavallaro, just a couple of items Mr. Chairman. The Mastery Test results have come back. We are in the process of meeting with Mrs. Valanzuolo and Mr. Clifford and putting together a report. Right now we can compare ourselves to ourselves, but they are waiting to see when they are released from the state officially how we compare to surrounding towns and other towns in our ERG. Soon as we are allowed to release that information and the State releases all of the information we will certainly bring that before the Board. Second, I know Bob Guthrie has been asking for a report on the progress of the math program. I think, we will compare, we are meeting tomorrow to put together the High School plan for school improvement that will be part of that plan. And we will certainly bring that before you as well as the progress we are making at the middle school and Elementary school. As you know the area that we are weak in at the High School is Math so the entire program needs to be centered around how we are going to improve Math scores. So we are meeting all day tomorrow with the staff from the High School as well as Dr. Kishomoto from ACES who is helping us prepare the plan and that will be a big piece of the Math. 3rd. which is also titles the Math, as well as in CAPT. in general, we will bring before the Board, which will be part of the yearly school improvement plan. Where we do a three week CAPT seminar in the areas for CAPT and what we will do before the Board is a curriculum in each of the areas to be improved, two or three weeks before the CAPT testing. We will stop what we are doing and center each class around that curriculum, again meeting the needs of each level and course. So, we will also be working on that.
Chairman Carrano, the meeting on the 25th will talk about the school improvement plan. Mr. Tortora, no the 31st, the 25th is the Rink, Stadium, Food Service and our transfers. Chairman Carrano, so the 31st is the School Improvements. Mt. Tortora, I would just like to add that there has been a request to bring the music department forward. I will make sure we get that scheduled.

C.1.b. Board.

Anne Heffernan, last night was a fundraiser at Savin Rock Conference Center for a student. I see in the back two gentlemen from AFSCME, I’m not sure if there is any else here from AFSCME. But they deserve thanks; they presented the family with two checks totaling $1,935.00. We did not beat AFSCME but we almost came close from tickets sales we raised $1,700.00. We did ok, but not as well as you guys. It was a really great time.

Howard Horvath, just let me follow up on that, and send another thanks to all the Board members for the tickets that you sold and your attendance. It was a great time for a good cause. I want to thank Superintendent Tortora, and the food service that was provided. Thank you to Anne and all her work. I think it was important to us as a school system, to let them know they are in our hearts and prayers. Also I would like to take a moment to Thank you to Chairman Carrano for his outstanding leadership, I was very excited when I heard early on that he was going to be leading us, I knew he would be an outstanding leader following another outstanding. He really lived up to all my expectations. I want to Thank you; you will be missed, nice job.

Mr. Guthrie, just a thanks to Mr. Horvath and Mrs. Heffernan for putting last night together. Everyone there enjoyed themselves, we appreciate the effort weither they said it or not they did. I look forward to the head line tour of Mr. Horvath this summer.

Howard Horvath, I did not thank the rum-runners, they are a group of some local but nearby towns. Some are firemen, when they are not out there saving lives; they are working good causes like this.

Anne Heffernan, the Chess team, I was told today that the Chess Team was very sad that I have been diverting my attention way from them. I just want to say publicly that I still love them and I am still their mom. We will be having a chi contest at the end of March. I hope everyone will attend and anyone who wants to compete please let me know.

Superintendent Tortora said we had some really nice press coverage of the team.

C.1.c. Committee.

Approval of Minutes:
Chairman Carrano asked for a MOTION to approve D.1. a
Regular Board Meeting of January 3, 2005 at 7:00 P.M. at Blake Building

MOTION made by Ray Collins and SECONDED by Anne Heffernan, Chairman Carrano
Discussion: Mr. Guthrie, at the last stage of the minutes, in the motion for Executive Session I opposed. Chairman Carrano, I remember that clearly. Anything else
MOTION passed unanimously with correction.
Chairman Carrano asked for a MOTION to approve D.2. 05-09
Resignations Non-Certified:

05-09 Trudy Gianninoto, 57 California Street, West Haven, CT 06516, Cashier at Savin Rock School, Effective: January 28, 2005, Reason: Personnel

MOTION made by Paul Messina and SECONDED by Toni Paine, Discussion: MOTION passed unanimously

Chairman Carrano asked for a MOTION to approve D.3. 05-10
New Hires: (Non-Certified)

05-10 Roberta Navarro, 16 Woodvale Road, West Haven, CT 06516, 3 ½ hour per day Cook at Thompson School, Effective: January 20, 2005, Salary $9.25 an hour

MOTION made by Mr. Guthrie and SECONDED by Ray Collins, Discussion: MOTION passed unanimously
Chairman Carrano, we have moved Executive Session to prier to D.4
MOTION to enter Executive Session, MOTION made by M. Toni Paine and SECONDED by Howard Horvath. Discussion: MOTION passed unanimously

Moved into Executive Session at 7:30 P.M.

Moved out of Executive Session at 8:00 P.M

Chairman Carrano asked for a MOTION to change effective date for D.4. 05-11
Termination: from January 20, 2005 to January 31, 2005
MOTION was made by Tonia Paine and SECONDED by Paul Messina, Anne Heffernan opposed, Discussion Motion to changed date passed by 2/3 vote
Chairman Carrano asked for MOTION to approve 05-11 Effective: January 31, 2005

05-11 Peter Dixon, P.O. Box 16485, West Haven, CT 06516, Director Bennett Rink, Effective: January 31, 2005.

MOTION made by Robert Guthrie and SECONDED by Anne Hefferman Discussion: MOTION passed unanimously.

Chairman Carrano asked for a MOTION to approve E. 05-12
New Business:

05-12 Request by Gary Palermo two new paraprofessional positions, first paraprofessional for Seth Haley, 2nd position for a student at Thompson School
MOTION made by Anne Hefferman and SECONDED by Toni Paine, Discussion: MOTION passed unanimously

Chairman Carrano asked for MOTION to approve 05-13
05-13 Chairman John Carrano, letter of resignation, Effective: January 4, 2005
MOTION made by Toni Paine and SECONDED Robert Guthrie
Robert Guthrie It’s approved the resignation of John Carrano with regret and to call for an election for Chairman.
George Monahan, SECOND
Chairman Carrano, Discussion: there is a motion on the table
Toni Paine, Discussion, Discussion needs to be limited to the motion as it is printed. And all that it says is,
Chairman John Carrano, letter of resignation, Effective: January 4, 2005

George Monahan, Mr. Chairman there is a motion to amended an item on the Agenda and its a legal motion and we need to address

Chairman Carrano, it needs a 2/3 vote to pass, I don’t believe it’s a legal motion. Discussion:

Toni Paine anything that is in direct conflict of the by-laws of the West Haven Board of Education, which is a legal binding contract in the State of Connecticut. Is legal and a illegal motion is not recognized

Mr. Guthrie, I don’t know if you want to share with the Board, obviously you had some concerns before you presented your letter. You received a legal opinion by the Board attorney and it did call for a vote, correct?

Chairman Carrano, the legal opinion from Mr. Dugas did call for a vote

George Monahan, yes

Toni Paine, the was a legal opinion and only a legal opinion of one lawyer, the Board was not polled to ask for this legal opinion and it is in direct violation of the by-laws of the West Haven Board of Education which is a legal binding contract and anything in direct conflict with it is illegal.

Chairman Carrano, yes, Mr. Monahan

George Monahan, the legal opinion sought is in direct accordance with our Board policy and by-laws. The responsibility of the Chair is to seek legal opinion from the Board attorney to resolve any such legal issues. He sought that, the opinion was granted and that is where this Board stands.

Toni Paine, any conflict with a legal binding contract needs to be decided on by the court. An opinion is just that an opinion and cannot be decided for the Board.

George Monahan, it is not a legal binding contract with all due respect.

Toni Paine, I respectfully disagree with you. It states right in it, it is a legal binding contract for the State of Connecticut. Toni Paine apologized to Chairman Carrano for not waiting to be called on.

Anne Heffernan, Under Roberts’ s Rules of Order the Chairman is allowed to deny any motion; he can over turn any motion. And to over turn that Chairman would require 2/3 vote by the Board.

Are you willing to accept?

Chairman Carrano, I would like to hear the other discussion first.

Anne Heffernan, I’m sorry I was trying to cut through the malarkey

Chairman Carrano, I appreciate that.

Anne Heffernan, it’s snowing

George Monahan, can someone point out to me what legal contract we are talking about that we are in potentially in violation of. Even though we already have a clear finding from the Board attorney on this matter. I would be more then happy to review it.

Chairman Carrano, yes, Mrs. Paine

Toni Paine, you don’t have a finding, you have an opinion

Mr. Guthrie, then we are in trouble, we based the previous action on an opinion also.

Toni Paine that is litigation that is on going. That is something we requested that he do. He advised us, he did not give us. We voted on it.

George Monahan, that’s what we are asking to do here, is to vote.

Toni Paine, and that is what is in direct conflict with the by-laws

George Monahan, we have advice now and we want to vote on it. It is well with in the Board discretion and right to vote on who they believe their leadership should be, again if someone can point out what contract we are suppose to be under the guidance or direction of, I would be more then happy to review that at this time. But if no one can recite which contract we are talking about. The I believe we need to move forward with the Boards attorneys opinion which is based on State statue along with Board policy

Toni Paine, it states it in the state contract, and the state by-laws

George Monahan, State statue 10-219 calls for a vote to determine the leader of a Board.
Chairman Carrano, Go ahead
Toni Paine, no it doesn’t, it does not. I have all the statute here. First of all a contract is to be taken in its entirety. You don’t pick and choose what you wish to read and what you don’t wish to read. A contract is taken in its entirety, and if you read the entire contract. What you are suggesting is in direct conflict.
George Monahan, which contract are you talking about that we are in direct conflict of?
Toni Paine, first the West Haven Board of Education by-laws and then the State
George Monahan, which segment of the by-laws. Which one are you talking about?
Toni Paine, I have here 9221, I have 9121 A, and B, 9122, which states what officers are involved, which is the Vice-Chair, Chairman and the Secretary.
George Monahan, Board Policy 9121 which defines the role of the chairperson which clearly states if there is a legal issue, he is obligated to obtain legal advice, opinion, ruling what ever you want to call it from the designated Board attorney.
Toni Paine, it also
George Monahan, Chairman Carrano has done that, board policy 9122 which defines the role of the office of vice-chair in the section you’re talking about in the case of an absence, illness, or resignation the vice-chairman as deemed by the board. Definition of Deemed means considered or judged. The attorney sited that very clearly in his finding.
Anne Heffernan, didn’t we deem her vice-chair when we elected her.
George Monahan, we deemed her vice-chair, we have not deemed her an automatic Chairman, and if I can continue we will get to clarification of it. By-laws of the board policy 9221 the filling of vacancies and this policy clearly defines what a vacancy is including a resignation. It says when there is a vacancy. We have a resignation on the table, pending resignation, with revering to either approve or disapprove. Mr. Guthrie has requested a legal motion to amend the agenda to include the vote. Policy 9221 states that any vacancy which is already defined which includes resignation. When that occurs the board shall elect the new officer to fill that vacancy. Board policy 9222, which goes in and defines what a resignation is and obviously Mr. Carrano request to resign is clearly his choice. I too regret that he is resigning. It is on the record I was strong advocate of Mr. Chairman, Mr. Carrano to become Chairman of this board. I made the nomination to put him in that seat which was successful. But I’m very disappointed that he is leaving. That he has decided to give up that seat. But in all due respect he has family issues and work issues. He has done a tremendous job as Chair that is not what we are discussing at this point. And State statues 10-219 which is site as a reference document is board policy states that the procedure for filling the vacancy on the board is in fact determined by a vote by the board, so if someone can place a document so called contract in front of me that differs from these documents. Our policies, our by-laws, which has been clarified in a opinion by the board attorney. I would be happy to consider it. But until I see that I stand firmly in the comments I made.
Chairman Carrano- asked Mrs. Heffernan if she was all set
Anne Heffernan – all set.
Raymond Collins, I like everyone else on this board. I to have gone threw the policy very diligently I also have sought out legal opinion on my own; these are fellow attorneys that have nothing to do with the City, don’t live in this City, no bias, and have never contributed to a political campaign in this city and this is just a synopsis of what I got and I would like to share. I would argue that the Vice-chairperson automatically becomes Chairperson, Chairman, as stated in the By Laws of the Board (9122) Office of the Vice-Chairperson, which states: The Vice-Chairperson will: In case of illness, resignation, or death of the Chairperson, the Vice-Chairperson, as deemed by the Board, becomes Chairperson for the unexpired term. The argument would be that the word deemed is intended to mean that is has already been established and set-forth herein. Otherwise it would state that the board shall elect a new
Chairperson, as is clearly set-forth under the subsection filling vacancies of the by-laws 9221, under this section it is stated that: Any vacancy occurring on the Board caused by death, resignation or otherwise, shall be filled by the Mayor for the remainder of the unexpired term. Said appointment shall be subject to confirmation by a majority vote of the City Council. Such vacancies will be formally announced to the Board one of its regularly scheduled meeting. The newly appointed and confirmed member shall assume office at the next meeting of the Board of Education. I simply reference the aforesaid subsection to make the point that there is a clear distinction between filling a vacancy of any member of the board, thus requiring a new person to be added to the board. This is not the case with Carrano, as he is not leaving the board entirely; he is merely resigning as the Chairman. He will remain on the board, thus there is no "vacancy" of a new spot to be filled. Carrano is merely resigning as Chairperson, and procedure for such resignation is clearly set-forth in subsection Office of the Vice-Chairperson # 4 In case of illness, resignation, or death of Chairperson, the Vice-Chairperson, as deemed by the board, becomes Chairperson for the unexpired term. The argument made that the word deemed is intended to mean that the board member should elect a new Chairman. The By Laws intended the authority to go to the members of the board to select a new chairperson, in conformance it would have been clearly established and set-forth specific procedures to follow, as it does relative to Filling a Vacancy, as well as other subsections. However, it does not. Therefore, it is evident that the verbiage "as deemed", is clearly intended to mean “as already established" by the board. Furthermore, it is argued that the board members should elect a new Chairperson pursuant to the By-laws of the Board (9221) Board Officer Vacancies, which immediately follows aforesaid subsection on filling Vacancies, which states: Whenever there is a vacancy in the office of chairperson or secretary, the Board shall elect a new officer to fill the vacancy for the unexpired term of office. The argument as previously stated, is that there is no vacancy in any similar manner in which a vacancy is defined in the aforesaid subsection. The aforesaid subsection is clearly intended to mean that if a vacancy of the Chairperson or Secretary is created through an election year, or by a board member no longer remaining on the board for whatever reason, than the board shall elect a new officer. For instance, if Carrano, as Chairman, was not reelected during an election year, then the board would elect a new officer to fill the vacancy this is clearly not the case. Carrano is remaining on the board, thus no vacancy on the board is being created to fill. Clearly this subsection does not apply in this situation. Additionally, I would argue that the subsection of the Bylaws of the Board in Filling Vacancies is governed by Connecticut General Statues 10-219, which states: If a vacancy occurs in the office of any member of the local board of education, unless otherwise provided by charter or special act, such vacancy shall be filled by the remaining members of said board until the next regular town election, at which town election a successor shall be elected for the unexpired portion of the term, the official ballot specifying the vacancy to be filled. This statute clearly defines vacancy as one that creates an "open spot" for a new board member, and this is clearly not the situation here. Furthermore, regular town elections do not select and/ or designate a Chairperson; they merely elect a new board member and fill "vacancies". Thus, this further substantiates that the subsection of the Bylaws on Board Officer Vacancies does not apply to this particular situation. Carrano is merely resigning as Chairman, and the procedure to be followed is clearly set-forth in subsection, Office of the Vice-Chairperson, of the by-laws of the Board, Thus, upon Carrano’s resignation, as Chairperson, it has clearly already been established that the Vice-Chairperson, Toni Paine already deemed by the Board shall automatically become Chairperson, and Mr. Monahan when you referenced section 10-219, the other part you left out. Unless other wise provided by Charter and Special Act, and this is the Charter of our Board.

George Monahan that referred to a vacancy on a Board Member in general not an officer and both situations

Ray Collins, which is being hear to
George Monahan- both situations are clearly have other circumstances. We clearly define in our board in our by-laws for the Board of Ed that a vote will take place in the case of a vacancy of a standard Board Member, the City Charter clearly defines that the Mayor appoints that person. So both those cases there are special circumstances.

Ray Collins and the argument is that there is no vacancy, the first one supersedes that. The argument you are coming from is based on if the vacancy occurs, and there is no such vacancy.

George Monahan, the argument that I’m saying is a vacancy is defined as including a resignation in policy 9221. The resignation is a vacancy, any resignations, any vacancies, not a vacancy of a board member or vacancies of an officer, any vacancies. Which includes a resignation by definition in the policy? We clearly have a vacancy here and it states when there is a vacancy. The board shall elect a new officer. Now in all due respect, If Miss Paine is interested in pursuing the office of Chair, she has every right to seek a nomination and see if she can achieve the votes. It is well with-in her right as is for any other Board Member.

Ray Collins, I don’t think it is a matter of who is interested in running for Chairperson. We are elected to up hold the by-laws of the board and this is clearly, what you are looking to do against Board policy.

George Monahan- we are up holding the by-laws of the Board, the Chairman had questions regarding these by-laws and sought the legal opinion of the legal attorney that we designated as our legal council and he has established the opinion.

Ray Collins, he has established an opinion, but if you go back to officers

George Monahan, we are bound by his opinion

Chairman Carrano, no

Toni Paine, we are not bound by his opinion, no we are not, absolutely not

Chairman Carrano would like Mr. Monahan to finish his statement, and then Mrs. Paine will be asked a question.

George Monahan – I’m done

Floyd Dugas, first of all, you are not bound by my opinion I want to make that clear.

Chairman Carrano, I know that.

Floyd Dugas, Toni was correct when she said you take advice from me, sometimes you follow it, and sometimes you don’t. That is absolutely you prerogative. We can talk this thing to death, I have analyzed it to death, kicked it around my office to death and Ray with all do respect to who wrote that ever other word was, it could be argued, it could be argued, we could argue this all day long. But anyone who looks at these two provisions and says it is crystal clear of what we do here is kidding themselves and kidding each other. There is clearly a conflict between the two provisions. As lawyers we try to reconcile it one way or another. The more I look at this the more I’m convinced that they are irreconcilable, they conflict. Therefore I made the recommendation it is not a binding opinion in any sense. I made a recommendation that in any situation what would be the fairest approach. I hope Toni understands it is not a reflection on her, I have been involved with this board for a long time, she is an outstanding Board Member, this has nothing to do with any of those issues, it is just my recommendation in light of what appeared to be an irreconcilable with those provisions nothing more.

Chairman Carrano, yes, Mrs. Paine

Toni Paine, with all due respect, if there are any discrepancies or conflicts or anything like that. We are obliged to revert back to Robert’s Rules, as we well know because the Mayor took us to court about a year and half ago, and when there was something that was lacking, Robert’s Rules has the final word on that. Although I do not see any conflict in there I think it is pretty crystal clear and I as well have three independent legal opinions, all who read it exactly the same way.

Howard Horvath, based on what I am hearing, do we have any precedence on this? I have only been on the board of year, but have we ever done this before.

Chairman Carrano, no
Toni Paine, no
Howard Horvath, has there ever been a Chairman who resigned in the past
Chairman Carrano, not in the middle of a term, there has been a Chairman who decided not to
be Chair after they were reelected. Not the middle of the term.
Mr. Guthrie, I would just like to ask Mr. Collins, the legal reference that the opinion of what firm?
Ray Collins, It was offered to the Board as my own personal, this was my own feeling; this was
not created by someone.
Mr. Guthrie, Ray I hope it will be part of the minutes for us all to review
George Monahan, it was not from an attorney
Toni Paine, it was not from an attorney
George Monahan, you said you sought legal council
Ray Collins, I said I sought legal opinion, based on that I created my own notes. I was not
reading a document from an attorney. If that is what you’re looking for.
Chairman Carrano, do you need more tape Rose
Superintendent Tortora, Rose when that comes to an end. Please stop the discussion, so we
can put in a new tape.
Clerk: I’ll change it now
Howard Horvath, I’m a little unclear as to where we are at.
Anne Heffernan, Motion to amend
Howard Horvath, is there a motion to amend
George Monahan and a second
Howard Horvath, to vote on the new chair, is this correct.
Chairman Carrano, the motion is to accept the resignation and vote on a new Chairman, the
change to the Agenda needs a 2/3 vote. That would be six people. If the motion is accepted,
which I do not think it is a legal motion. We have had Discussion: and with all due respect to the
Board opinion we have just had the gentlemen who said that opinion say it is not straight forward
at all. We had a recommendation to vote. I believe the by-laws are very straight forward as well.
Unfortunately you and I disagree, several of us all disagree, that’s ok that’s why there is nine of
us. I also believe the intent of 9122 is having the vice-chairperson come forward. She is the vice-
Chairperson deemed by the Board. So I do not accept the motion to amend the Agenda the way
it. Now I am looking for a MOTION to accept 05-13, Chairman John Carrano, letter of resignation,
effective: January 4, 2005
MOTION was made by Toni Paine
Howard Horvath, can I get some clarification first?
Anne Heffernan SECOND, now you can
Howard Horvath, you have the prerogative to without asking if we are in agreement. To deny it
Chairman Carrano, I believe so
Anne Heffernan, you could ask for a vote, this is Robert’s Rules, you can ask for a poll of the
Board and to over turn the Chairman you will need 2/3rd’s
Howard Horvath, well then that’s what I would like to ask,
Toni Paine, then call for a count, please
Mr. Guthrie, we are still in discussion; correct?
George Monahan, sure
Mr. Guthrie, for clarification a motion to the affirmative will accept your resignation, a motion to
deny it, will not accept your resignation until we get clarification and obviously the great legal
debate we have here.
Chairman Carrano, to make sure everyone is clear,
Anne Heffernan- first we are going to do a roll call vote for Howie, isn’t that what we are going
to do first?
Howard Horvath, I’m happy going where that is appropriate, I do want to be sure of what I a
voting on. That’s my request.
Chairman Carrano, a motion in the affirmative, a yes vote, will mean no adds' to this thing that is resigned and I turn it over to Toni Paine, a motion to the negative means we then go back into discussion on some other stuff. So we will do a roll call vote. Howard Horvath, Mrs. Heffernan is that correct. Chairman Carrano, is everyone comfortable with that, does everyone understand. Howard Horvath, I thought another motion jumped in there and got seconded. Anne Heffernan, I thought Howie ?? Toni Paine, it was to amend it, but it was declined. Howard Horvath, and now we are supposed to vote to determine whether or not we are in agreement with the Chairman denying that vote. Toni Paine, as is Howard Horvath, the Chairman about denying that motion. Toni Paine, no. Anne Heffernan, but that is what I’m saying, Howie wanted to clean that up. Chairman Carrano, the motion on the table was me resigning nothing else. Howard Horvath, ok. Chairman Carrano, if you say yes, what I am going to do after it is over, is hand the meeting over to Toni Paine so she can finish it. Howard Horvath, ok, so we want to get back to the amended thing we vote no. Chairman Carrano, I really want to see Bobby vote no against for me resigning for Chair. Krista Pickering, so voting no is going to say that we don’t agree with. Chairman Carrano, my interpretation, which is not to vote on a chair. Mr. Guthrie, that’s not correct. Toni Paine, it’s just that you are not accepting your resignation end of story, that all we doing. Anne Heffernan- what we are voting on now, is we are not accepting your resignation, voting no is accepting your resignation, voting yes is accepting your resignation. Mr. Guthrie, voting no, would not accept your resignation and resolve apparently many legal difference of opinions. Chairman Carrano, say that again. Krista Pickering, voting yes means. Mr. Guthrie, means accept his resignation. Krista Pickering, and that means. Mr. Guthrie that we are accepting the vice-chair will take over the meeting. Chairman Carrano, that not what I said? I said it wrong? Anne Heffernan, no, you said it wrong. Howard Horvath, that’s good enough, I think we are done. I hope we are clear. Chairman Carrano: Mrs. Heffernan, your starting with me, alright. Yes, I would love to accept your resignation with regret, but if it will make you happy, ok. Krista Pickering, No. Howard Horvath, No. Ray Collins, yes, with regret. Paul Messina, No. Toni Paine, yes, with regret. George Monahan, No. Robert Guthrie, I don’t want to have any regrets John, so no you can’t leave. Chairman Carrano, I would vote yes, obviously, so, 5-4 Motion did not pass. Mr. Guthrie, Congratulations. Chairman Carrano, Thank you, I thought I got rid of this January 4th. Ok. Toni Paine, now go on for informational. George Monahan, we all said you were good.
WEST HAVEN BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES
January 19, 2005

Howard Horvath, so we can to it all over again
Ray Collins, it’s like a nightmare isn’t it?

Chairman Carrano, I just have it on record that Mr. Guthrie voted to keep me instead
Mr. Guthrie, absolutely

F. Informational:
Chairman Carrano, Mrs. Paine anything on informational

Mrs. Paine – No
Chairman Carrano, I’m sorry I started on the wrong side.
Mr. Guthrie – No thank you
George Monahan – No
Toni Paine- No
John Carrano - No
Paul Messina - No
Ray Collins - No
Howard Horvath – No
Anne Heffernan – yes, if any one has any recipes, please contact me, o the Board office

Chairman Paine asked for a MOTION to ADJOURN
MOTION was made by Anne Heffernan and SECONDED by Paul Messina
MOTION passed unanimously

Meeting ADJOURNED at 9.25 P.M